The Honorable Administrator Scott Pruitt US Environmental Protection Agency 1200 Pennsylvania Ave, NW Washington, DC 20004

September 6, 2017

## **Dear Administrator Pruitt:**

As associations representing many businesses, both large and small, that employ millions of Americans, and local governments in which those businesses thrive, we are deeply concerned about the harmful impact that the Environmental Protection Agency's (EPA) 2015 rule, to make ozone standards the most stringent ever, could have on the economy. The EPA's current regulations are working, air quality continues to improve, and the United States is leading the world in reducing emissions. Implementation of the new ozone standards could significantly damage the economy by imposing unachievable emissions limits and reduction targets on almost every part of our country, including rural and undeveloped areas. Therefore, we strongly urge you to expeditiously reconsider the 2015 ozone standards.

We all value clean air. The managers and employees of the companies we represent, as well as their families, all breathe the same air. We are proud that emissions of ozone-forming compounds have been cut in half since 1980, leading to a 33% drop in ozone concentrations. Moreover, EPA issued the guidance to states just two years ago to implement the 2008 ozone standards. The country can expect to see even greater reductions in ground-level ozone as states make up lost ground in putting those standards into effect.

Indeed, states and businesses are currently committing substantial resources – both in time and money – towards achieving emissions reductions under those 2008 ozone standards. Despite over three decades of cleaner air and before states can catch up with EPA's delays in implementing existing ozone standards, EPA finalized tighter standards of 70 parts per billion that could bring additional areas of the country into nonattainment. Local communities could face burdens to commercial and industrial activity not only vital to creating jobs, but also to providing tax revenue that supports important local services like public safety and education. Unless addressed soon, the rule's hardship to the American worker could be real and immediate. Furthermore, approximately half of the states across the nation have indicated their concerns with tightening the standards.

If implemented, EPA's stringent ozone standards could limit business expansion in many areas of the United States and risk the ability of U.S. companies to create new jobs. The standards add red tape to companies seeking to grow even in areas that can attain those standards. The Clean Air Act carries even stiffer consequences for nonattainment areas, which can directly impact economic vitality of local communities and make it difficult to attract and develop business. Increased costs associated with restrictive and expensive permit requirements could likely deter companies from siting new facilities in a nonattainment area, making the United States a less attractive place to do business and risking shipping jobs overseas.

Companies building a new facility or performing major modifications to certain existing facilities resulting in increased ozone concentrations in, or near, a nonattainment area will be required

to meet the most stringent Clean Air Act standards by installing the most effective emission reduction technology regardless of cost. As well, states are mandated to offset any ozone-forming emissions from new projects or projects undergoing major modifications by reducing emissions from other existing sources in a nonattainment area. If no party is willing to provide offsets, then the project cannot go forward. This offset requirement can be a 2-to-1 ratio in certain situations. Nonattainment designation also has profound impact on infrastructure development vital to the business community. Beginning one year from the date of the nonattainment designation, federally-supported highway and transit projects cannot proceed in a nonattainment area unless the state can demonstrate that the project will cause no increase in ozone emissions.

These restrictions do not disappear when an area finally comes into attainment. Instead, former nonattainment areas face a legacy of EPA regulatory oversight. Before a nonattainment area can be redesignated to attainment, EPA must receive and approve an enforceable maintenance plan for the area that specifies measures providing continued maintenance of ozone standards and contingency measures to be implemented promptly if an ozone standard is violated.

Against these economic consequences, scientific uncertainties regarding the benefits of the stringent ozone standards are significant. Indeed, stringent ozone standards may have severe unintended consequences for public health. Studies show that by increasing the costs of goods and services such as energy, and decreasing disposable incomes, regulation can inadvertently harm the socio-economic status of individuals and, thereby, contribute to poor health and premature death. As representatives of businesses providing needed jobs in our communities, as well as the community leaders themselves, we believe these scientific uncertainties should be better explored in order to best allocate resources in a manner that strengthens both the economy and the environment.

The air is getting cleaner and the 2008 ozone standards need an opportunity to work. Therefore, in light of the potential economic hardship, and uncertain benefits related to the stringent ozone standards, we call on EPA to expeditiously reconsider the 2015 ozone standards.

## Sincerely,

Alabama Energy Institute
Alabama Petroleum Council
Alabama Pulp & Paper Council
Business Council of Alabama
Manufacture Alabama
Mobile Area Chamber of Commerce
AGC Arkansas
Agricultural Council of Arkansas
ARBEV
Arkansas Asphalt Pavement Association
Arkansas Automobile Dealers Association
Arkansas Environmental Federation
Arkansas Farm Bureau
Arkansas Forest and Paper Council
Arkansas Forestry Association

Arkansas Hospitality Association

Arkansas Independent Producers and Royalty Owners Association

Arkansas Oil Marketers Association

Arkansas Petroleum Council

Arkansas Ready Mixed Concrete Association

Arkansas State Chamber of Commerce/Associated Industries of Arkansas

Arkansas Timber Producers Association

Arkansas Trucking Association

Associated Builders and Contractors of Arkansas

Colorado Association of Commerce & Industry

Colorado Association of Mineral Royalty Owners

Colorado Cattlemen's Association

Colorado Dairy Farmers

Colorado Farm Bureau

Colorado Motor Carriers Association

Colorado Petroleum Association

Colorado Petroleum Council

Grand Junction Area Chamber of Commerce

Connecticut Bus Association

Connecticut Business & Industry Association

Connecticut Energy Marketers Association

Connecticut Petroleum Council

Connecticut School Transportation Association

Gasoline and Automotive Service Dealers of America

Associated Industries of Florida

Florida Automobile Dealers Association

Florida Chamber of Commerce

Florida Forestry Association

Florida Natural Gas Association

Florida Natural Gas Vehicle Coalition

Florida Petroleum Council

Florida Propane Gas Association

Florida Restaurant and Lodging Association

Florida State Hispanic Chamber of Commerce

Florida Transportation Builders' Association

The James Madison Institute

Associated General Contractors of Georgia

Georgia Agribusiness Council

Georgia Asphalt Pavement Association

Georgia Association of Convenience Stores

Georgia Association of Manufacturers

Georgia Chamber of Commerce

Georgia Chemistry Council

Georgia Concrete Contractors Association

Georgia Construction Aggregate Association

Georgia Electric Membership Corporation

**Administrator Scott Pruitt** 

September 6, 2017

Page 4

Georgia Farm Bureau

Georgia Food Industry Association

Georgia Highway Contractors Association

Georgia Mining Association

Georgia Motor Trucking Association

Georgia Oilmen's Association

Georgia Paper and Forest Products Association

Georgia Petroleum Council

Georgia Poultry Federation

Georgia Railroad Association

Georgia Ready Mixed Concrete Association

Metro Atlanta Chamber

Oglethorpe Power Corporation

Chemical Industry Council of Illinois

Grain and Feed Association of Illinois

Illinois Association of Aggregate Producers

Illinois Association of Convenience Stores

Illinois Association of County Engineers

Illinois Coal Association

Illinois Farm Bureau

Illinois Manufactures Association

Illinois Oil and Gas Association

Illinois Petroleum Council

Illinois Petroleum Marketers Association

Illinois Retail Merchants Association

Illinois Trucking Association

Mid-West Truckers Association

Operators Engineers Local 150

Agribusiness LLC

AIM-Accelerating Indiana Municipalities

**APPIAN** 

Association of Indiana Counties

Construction Advancement Foundation of Northwest Indiana, Inc

CountryMark

Greater Elkhart Chamber

**H&C Climate Control** 

Hendricks County Commissioner Matt Whetstone

Indiana Builders Association

Indiana Cast Metal Association

Indiana Chamber of Commerce

Indiana Coal Council

Indiana Electric Cooperatives

Indiana Grocery and Convenience Store Association

Indiana Manufactured Housing Association

Indiana Manufacturers Association

Indiana Motor Truck Association

Administrator Scott Pruitt

September 6, 2017

Page 5

Indiana Oil and Gas Association

Indiana Petroleum Council

Indiana Petroleum Marketers and Convenience Store Association

Indiana Retail Council

Indiana Utility Shareholders Association

**Indy Chamber** 

Recreation Vehicle Indiana Council

Southwest Chamber

American Council of Engineering Companies of Iowa

Associated General Contractors of Iowa

Iowa Association of Business and Industry

Iowa Engineering Society

Iowa Good Roads Association

Iowa Motor Truck Association

Master Builders of Iowa

Society of Land Surveyors of Iowa

**CVR** Energy

Kansas Agribusiness Retailers Association

Kansas Chamber of Commerce

Kansas Farm Bureau

Kansas Grain & Feed Association

Kansas Independent Oil & Gas Association

Kansas Manufacturing Council

Kansas Petroleum Council

Renew Kansas Ethanol Association

Maine State Chamber of Commerce

Maryland Chamber of Commerce

Maryland Farm Bureau

Maryland Highway Users Federation

Maryland Motor Truck Association

Maryland Petroleum Council

Maryland Retailers Association

Maryland Transportation Builders and Materials Association

Mid-Atlantic Petroleum Distributors Association

Service Station Dealers of America and Allied Trades \*

Tire Industry Association \*

WMDA Service Station and Automotive Repair Association

Massachusetts Energy Marketers Association

Massachusetts Petroleum Council

Massachusetts Petroleum Council

New England Convenience Store & Energy Marketers Association

Associated Food and Petroleum Dealers of Michigan

Associated Petroleum Industries of Michigan

Grand Rapids Chamber of Commerce

Michigan Aggregates Association

Michigan Electric and Gas Association

Michigan Farm Bureau

Michigan Infrastructure and Transportation Association

Michigan Manufacturers Association

Michigan Oil and Gas Association

Cooperative Network Minnesota

Minnesota Chamber of Commerce

Minnesota Grocers Association

Minnesota Petroleum Council

Minnesota Trucking Association

MN AgriGrowth Council

MN Petroleum Marketers Association

Associated General Contractors of Missouri

Associated Industries of Missouri

Association of Missouri Electric Cooperatives

Chemistry Council of Missouri

County Commissioners Association of Missouri

**Empire Springfield Grocers Association** 

Mid-America Grocers Association

Mining Industry Council of Missouri

Missouri Asphalt Pavement Association

Missouri Association of Counties

Missouri Chamber of Commerce

Missouri Chapter of Freedom of the Road Riders

Missouri Concrete Association

Missouri Energy Development Association

Missouri Farm Bureau

Missouri Forest Products Association

Missouri Grocers Association

Missouri Limestone Association

Missouri Municipal League

Missouri Petroleum Council

Missouri Petroleum Marketers & Convenience Store Association

Missouri Retailers Association

Missouri Tire Dealers and Retreaders Association

Missouri Transportation & Development Council

Missouri Trucking Association

North East County Commissioners Association of Missouri

North West County Commissioners Association of Missouri

Regulatory Environmental Group for Missouri

SITE Improvement Association

South Central County Commissioners Association of Missouri

South East County Commissioners Association of Missouri

South West County Commissioners Association of Missouri

West Central County Commissioners Association of Missouri

Nebraska Farm Bureau Federation

Nebraska Petroleum Marketers & Convenience Store Association

Administrator Scott Pruitt

September 6, 2017

Page 7

Nebraska Petroleum Producers Association

Nebraska State Chamber of Commerce & Industry

Nebraska Trucking Association

Business & Industry Association of New Hampshire

New Hampshire Motor Transport Association

New Jersey Petroleum Council

API New York

Carolinas Associated General Contractors (NC & SC)

North Carolina Petroleum & Convenience Marketers Association

North Carolina Petroleum Council

Associated General Contractors of North Dakota

Bismarck-Mandan Chamber of Commerce

Greater North Dakota Chamber of Commerce

North Dakota Petroleum Council

North Dakota Petroleum Marketers Association

North Dakota Propane Gas Association

North Dakota Retail Association

Utility Shareholders of North Dakota

API Ohio

Canton Regional Chamber of Commerce

International Union of Operating Engineers, Local 18

Ohio Aggregates & Industrial Minerals Association

Ohio Chamber of Commerce

Ohio Chemistry Technology Council

Ohio Coal Association

Ohio Contractors Association

Ohio Gas Association

**Ohio Grocers Association** 

Ohio Home Builders Association

Ohio Licensed Beverage Association

Ohio Manufacturers' Association

Ohio Municipal League

Ohio Oil and Gas Association

Ohio Petroleum Marketers & Convenience Store Association

**Ohio Trucking Association** 

Ohio's Electric Cooperatives

Plumbers & Pipefitters Local 396

Southeastern Ohio Oil and Gas Association

Youngstown/Warren Regional Chamber

**ARIPPA** 

Associated Pennsylvania Constructors

Associated Petroleum Industries of Pennsylvania

Chamber Of Commerce For Greater Philadelphia

Greater Pittsburgh Chamber of Commerce

Manufacturer and Business Association

Maritime Exchange for the Delaware River and Bay

Administrator Scott Pruitt September 6, 2017

Page 8

Pennsylvania Aggregates and Concrete Association

Pennsylvania Chemical Industry Council

Pennsylvania Coal Alliance

Pennsylvania Farm Bureau

Pennsylvania Food Merchants Association

Pennsylvania Forest Products Association

Pennsylvania Independent Oil and Gas Association

Pennsylvania Manufacturers Association

Pennsylvania Petroleum Association

Pennsylvania Waste Industries Association

The Energy Council of Rhode Island

API South Carolina

South Dakota Chamber of Commerce and Industry

South Dakota Electric Utility Companies

South Dakota Petroleum and Propane Marketers Association

South Dakota Retailers Association

Tennessee Fuel and Convenience Store Association

Tennessee Petroleum Council

Vermont Fuel Dealers Association

Vermont Petroleum Association

Vermont Retail and Grocers Association

American Council of Engineering Companies of Virginia

Associated General Contractors of Virginia

LiUNA! Laborers' Local 11

Precast Concrete Association of Virginia

Thomas Jefferson Institute for Public Policy

Virginia Agribusiness Council

Virginia Automobile Dealers Association

Virginia Chamber of Commerce

Virginia Coal & Energy Alliance

Virginia Farm Bureau

Virginia Forest Products Association

Virginia Forestry Association

Virginia FREE

Virginia Manufacturers Association

Virginia Oil and Gas Association

Virginia Petroleum Council

Virginia Petroleum, Convenience and Grocery Association

Virginia Poultry Federation

Virginia Retail Merchants Association

Virginia Transportation Construction Alliance

Virginia Trucking Association

Associated Builders & Contractors of WI

Cooperative Network of Wisconsin

Midwest Food Products Association

Milwaukee Metropolitan Association of Commerce

Wisconsin Transportation Builders Association

Transportation Development Association of Wisconsin

Wisconsin Auto & Truck Dealers Association

Wisconsin Grocers Association

Wisconsin Housing Alliance

Wisconsin Industrial Energy Group

Wisconsin Manufacturers & Commerce

Wisconsin Motor Carriers Association

Wisconsin Paper Council

Wisconsin Petroleum Council

Wisconsin Petroleum Marketers & Convenience Stores Association